

**CHAPTER VII**  
**SUMMARY, DISCUSSION, RECOMMENDATIONS**

**SUMMARY OF THE STUDY**

This study examined the level of anticipated turnover and identify the factors which influenced the anticipated turnover among professional nurses in Chulalongkorn Hospital. A descriptive, cross-sectional design was used to study the relationships among variables and the determination the explanatory power of the selected factors in predicting anticipated turnover. A survey strategy using a self-administered questionnaire was sent to 304 nurses who worked on Emergency, Out-patient, Medical, Operating, Obstetrical/Gynecological, Surgical, Critical care and Pediatrics; 297 (97.7%) nurses participated in this study.

A set of questionnaires were hand out to those nurses in 8 areas in Chulalongkorn Hospital. A questionnaire consisting of 120 items of 8 parts. In each part was shown as follows. Part one was the demographic characteristic of each sample. Part two through eight were the scale involved with the anticipated turnover. The instruments to measure variables included Hinshaw and Atwood's (1987) Anticipated turnover scale, Autonomy, Job stress. Price and Muller's (1981) workload scale, Instrumental communication scale, Internal labor market and External labor market. And lastly Job satisfaction scale Hackman & Oldham (1975). All were used in this study. These scale translated into Thai language and validated by

a group of the expertises. The investigator constructed items to measure demographics, actual tenure, working experience. Reliability and validity of study were assessed through a pilot test and post test.

The average age of the participants was 33.4 years and all were females. The majority was not married and had more than 10 years experience as a nurse. A bachelor's degree was highest nursing degree held for most participants. Most of them had rotating workshift and average salary was 7471.61 baht.

#### DISCUSSION OF FINDING

The findings of this study are discussed and interpreted as follow. This study is to determine the level of anticipated turnover. The survey revealed that a group mean of 43.56 ( min-max =12-84 ) revealed that is a moderate level. Intents to leave, in general, were more than weak but no more than moderate but this study revealed highly consistent with Hinshaw and Atwood's (1984) mean anticipated turnover of 37.8 for their sample. A possible answer lies in the fact that anticipated turnover has only been able to predict 18% ( Price & Mueller, 1981 ) to 31% ( Hinshaw and Atwood, 1987 ) of variance in actual turnover. In addition Loke (1984) cautioned that individuals may or may not act on their intentions. Weisman, Alexander, and Chase (1981) measured anticipated turnover by asking respondents to report the number of job hunts since employed. Nurses in their study reported looking for another job an average of once since employed and had been employed an average of between two and three

years. However, it appears that anticipated turnover reported in the work previous investigators ( Hinshaw & Atwood, 1984 ). Weisman, Alexander, and Chase ( 1981 ) was consistently moderate in its reported strength. The level of anticipated in each department revealed that the intent to leave of critical care unit is highest (46.2) follow with emergency unit (45.36) and the lowest of intent to leave is out-patient unit (38.64). The study of the test hypothesis was used to operate in five characteristics, was shown as follow.

### HYPOTHESIS TESTING

#### HYPOTHESIS # 1

Age, kinship responsibility (number of children, marital status) workplace, tenure, work experience, salary, extra income, family income, spouse's workplace and travelling to work are positively correlated with anticipated turnover.

As shown in Table 11 where the Pearson correlation reveals that Age, number of children, work experience, salary were significantly association with anticipated turnover (p-value=.015, .002,.016,.019). Again, the data indicate a moderate negative correlation between age and anticipated turnover ( $r=-.2148$ , p-value=.015).

The number of children anticipated was a moderate negative correlation ( $r=-.2789$ , p-value=.002). Length of work experience and anticipated turnover was a moderate negative correlation ( $r=-.2128$ , p-value=.016). The salary and

anticipated turnover was a moderate negative correlation ( $r = -.2068$ ,  $p\text{-value} = .019$ ). The variable of extra income and family income were not correlated with anticipated turnover.

And also as shown in Table 10 one-way Anova method was used to analyse the marital status, workplace, tenure, spouse's workplace and travelling to work were correlated with anticipated turnover with significantly ( $p\text{-value} = .0095, .0001$  and  $.04$ ). Two variables of education level and Spouse's workplace were not correlation with anticipated turnover.

The first hypothesis which predicted a positive relationship between age and anticipated turnover, number of children and anticipated turnover, work experience and anticipated turnover, salary and anticipated turnover was not supported this hypothesis, however these variables were negatively correlated with anticipated turnover with significantly.

## HYPOTHESIS # 2

The greater the perceived workload and stress, The higher the anticipated turnover.

The correlation between the perceived workload and anticipated turnover as shown in Table 10 indicates that a positive correlation between workload and anticipated turnover ( $r = .1110$ ,  $p\text{-value} = .026$ ) but the both correlation were weak ( $r < .20$ ).

The correlation between the perceived stress and anticipated turnover indicates that a positive correlation between the perceived stress and anticipated turnover ( $r=.2292, p\text{-value}=.000$ ) and the both correlation were moderate level. ( $r=.21, -.40$ ).

The hypothesis which predicted that both the perceived work load and stress would be positively related to anticipated turnover, was supported.

### HYPOTHESIS # 3

The higher job satisfaction, instrumental communication and autonomy, the lower anticipated turnover.

In the Table 11 shows the correlation between job satisfaction, instrumental communication, autonomy and anticipated turnover. The result indicate as follows.

1. A significant negative relationship between job satisfaction and anticipated turnover ( $r=-.3008, p\text{-value}=.000$ ) with moderate correlation.
2. A significant negative relationship between instrumental communication and anticipated turnover ( $r=-$
3. A significant negative relationship between autonomy and anticipated turnover ( $r=-.2920, p\text{-value}=.000$ ) with moderate correlation.

The hypothesis which predicted that all 3 variables would be negatively related to anticipated turnover was supported.

#### HYPOTHESIS # 4

The greater the perceived opportunity for alternative employment outside of the organization(external labor market),the higher the anticipated turnover.

In the Table 11 shows the relationship between the perceived opportunity for alternative employment outside and anticipated turnover,the result indicated as follows.

The correlation of 2 variables,external labor market and anticipated turnover was not significant relationship (p-value=184,r=.111).This was not supported hypothesis #4.

#### HYPOTHESIS # 5

The greater the perceived opportunity for promotion within the organization(internal labor market),the lower the anticipated turnover.

The result from Table 11,indicate that internal labor market and anticipated turnover was significantly negative relationship with weak correlation( $r=-.1520$ ,p-value=.004).This was supported hypothesis #5 as lower moderate level.

From the result of multiple regression found that. Job satisfaction emerged as the strongest predictor of anticipated turnover. Three variables ( number of children, internal labor market, autonomy ) also emerged as significant predictors of anticipated turnover. The predictor variables accounted for 29.63% of explained variance, for turnover in this study was actually much higher than other studies. Hinshaw et al. (1987) reported an explained variance of 20% for Baccalaureate prepared nurses and 16% for Diploma-prepared nurses for similar predictor variables including professional and organizational job satisfaction.

This study had similar findings to those of Wolf (1981) who reported that the primary causes of turnover are problems related to supervision and coordination, Job dissatisfaction, and the administrative system. Prestholdt et al. (1988) also reported the importance of the interrelationships of job satisfaction and the work environment on the decision to leave or stay within an organization.

Similar to findings of Aree Preuksaraj et al.(1991) that the staff nurses indicated dissatisfaction with their job. The causes of dissatisfaction included low salary, inappropriate fringe benefits, slow work, promotion, hard and repetitive working, conflict with administrative nursing personnel and with nursing staff in the unit. The study demonstrated the age was inversely predictive of anticipated turnover. This finding supported the research of Price (1977) and Abelson (1986), revealed that age has

been consistently correlated with turnover. And also older, more tenured employees are more resistant to leave an organization than are younger, less experienced individuals ( Mobley, Horner & Hollingersworth, 1978 ).

The kinship responsibility was a composite index of marital status, number of children. The high turnover stratum had the highest kinship responsibility mean, which would seem to indicate the possibility that kinship responsibility may be associated with preventing voluntary turnover.

For this finding, the number of children indicate a moderate negative correlation between the number of children and anticipated turnover (  $r = -.2789$ ,  $p\text{-value} = .002$  ). The result of Price, 1986, suport that number of children tends to be negatively correlated with actual turnover due to the potential negative impact on children's changing schools.

The correlation between work experience and anticipated turnover was a moderate negative correlation ( $r = -.2128$ ,  $p\text{-value} = .016$ ). The result of Seybolt et al, 1978 and Weisman et, 1980-81, were suported that shorter tenure in the organization has been correlated with turnover. That is, employees who are new to the organization have a higher rate of turnover than those with more tenure.

In the correlation analysis, 10 of 13 variables were related to anticipated turnover. The variables



related to anticipated turnover were age, work experience, number of children, salary, job satisfaction, autonomy, instrumental communication, internal labor market, workload and job stress.

The clear finding that job satisfaction had the largest significant correlation with anticipated turnover ( $r = -.3008$ ,  $p$ -value  $.000$ ) readily confirms the finding of Price and Mueller (1981), Weisman, Alexander and Chase (1981), and Hinshaw and Atwood (1987), who developed the turnover models upon which this study was based.

#### DISCRIMINANT ANALYSIS

In order to profile the group I ( low intent to leave) vs. group II ( high intent to leave ) on the factors in the Anticipated turnover among professional nurses in Chulalongkorn Hospital, discriminant analysis were conducted. Essentially, six factors, extra income, travelling to work, job satisfaction, autonomy, workload, stress, discribed the degree to which they anticipated leaving the location of nurse. These factors predicted the group I ( low intent to leave ) and group II ( high intent to leave ) at a 70.34% correctly.

## IMPLICATION AND RECOMMENDATION

In this study, it is found that the expectation level of professional nurse in Chulalongkorn Hospital is in moderate level and it could be anticipated that the tendency of turn over rate will get higher every year. It was showed in statistical record that from January to september, 1991, 90 professional nurses resigned from their post while only 100 professional nurses, who have just graduated from Nursing College of the Thai Red Cross Institute, were recruited each year. However, Chulalongkorn Hospital is a general hospital with 800 beds, while nursing services are increasing in many aspects and also there is a project of a new building, it is interesting to point that the demand of nurse is not equivalent to the new recruitments especially in each of the existing building of the hospital such as Poh Poh Roh building where nurses are insufficient.

By using discriminant analysis method, it is show in this study that there are some factors influence to an anticipation of the group of nurse who had high expectation to change their job. Those factors are work load, autonomy, extra income, travelling to work, job stress and job satisfaction respectively, Discriminant analysis method is useful for anticipating factors affecting turn over rate of professional nurses in the year 1991 where the most number of them resigned from their post. Those factors would be beneficial to plan for solving these problems at the first stage.

Job stress : is a issue and could be feasibility into action. The concept of job stress was defined as the frequency that encounters death and dying, emotional demands of patient and families, inadequate staffing and workoverload and conflicts with other nurses, physicians and administrators.

In this study, workload is a important issue to be considerable. Numerous studied have validated that and unrealistic workload has a tremendous influence on stress level of nurses and is directly to anticipated or actual turnover, burnout, job dissatisfaction, Because of the important of this variable in job satisfaction and retention, it is strongly recommended that the nurse manager pay particular attention to assuring realistic workloads and preserring the same in times when hospitals are facing severe economic challenges and nursing shortages. Clinical nurses and administrstive nurses must work together to redefine patient care delivery systems that realistically have professional nurses performing responsibilities that must be performed by the professional and delegating palliative, comfort, to other support personnel.

One strategy for reducing job stress related to inadequate preparation is the fostering a learning environment. This is recommened that the manergers work with staff to identify learning needs or skill deficiencies in order to provide appropriate continuing or inservice education to reduce the inherent fear and stress from being inadequately prepared.

One issue, which was significantly correlated to the job stress, was lack of support. Support is a little understood construct and can be defined differently depending on each individual's perspective. It is recommended that the manager talk with staff to better understand from their perspective what support means to them. In doing so, the manager can be better equipped to meet the employee's expectation of supervisor support and minimize the stress incurred when expectations are not met.

In addition, it could be a considerable study about work of nurses in detail in each unit. Assignment of work should be suitable to the capability of nurses in the unit. The main problem in general hospitals is that there is too big a number of patients for nurses to take care of them efficiently. So, executive staff nurses should look for the best way how to assign work suitably and nurses under supervisory can work happily, how to motivate and encourage them such as: to respect their achievement of work, assign something more responsible, to improve policy and administration for supporting them to get motivation and encouragement, to make good relations among groups and improve environment to work more happily.

income : It is always happened in the government hospitals that the income earned and expenditure are not equivalent. To solve the problem of turnover of professional nurses by increasing salary seems impractical. However, there are some ways to get extra income such as to offer OPD services for specific diseases in the evening or/and holidays, offer a meeting room for rent etc. Good

management for such extra services could distribute an extra income for them which would be a way to encourage them to work.

travelling to work : It is found that travelling to work is one important problem concerning turn over rate of professional nurse. Within the past 2 years, the traffic jam around Chulalongkorn Hosp. get more trouble. and it takes long time to come to work especially the one who engage to the task with their family and have to start travelling very early in the morning. This problem causes them get tired and boring and finally they would try to find another place to work close to their house. This problem can be solved if the hospital provide a vehicle to pick them to work.

other factors : such as autonomy and satisfaction of work are the feeling toward organization and reflects the structure and processes of the organization. Although organization climate is relatively stable overtime, the manager can influence the climate by her/his style of management. Organizational climate was conceptualized as a balance of individual autonomy, position structure, consideration and reward. In order to enhance a positive organization climate, it is recommended that the manager recognize the nurse's expertise as a clinician and empower her/him to participate in decisions, actions, and planning that effect patient care or the professional practice of nursing. Minimizing bureaucracy and traditional lines of communication facilitates the development of autonomy in

the professional nurse and will minimize the formal structure of the organization.

Position structure can inhibit the natural creativity of a nurse who wishes to risk individual participation in changes to unit functioning or patient care. Reward and recognition by the manager of the clinical nurses's contributions to quality patient care would facilitate the perception of a positive organizational climate. Leaders who demonstrate warmth, concern, and consideration will effect increased job satisfaction among the workforce. It is recommended that managers maximize positive changes in the organizational climate by facilitating nurses in all aspects of operation and by empowering nurses to seek creative solutions to day-to-day problems. In developing a true partnership relation with the nursing staff rather than the traditional bureaucratic relationship, The manager can positively effect the climate of the organization and ultimately the job satisfaction of the individual nurses.

#### SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

1. The research should be examine inner working of patient care unit in Chulalongkorn hospital to determine the extent to which consensus, coordination, control and commitment are presented.
2. The research should compare the anticipated turnover among university hospitals in Thailand.
3. Futher study should test the instruments for anticipated turnover.